Publication Data:


ISSN 0928-6802

© Copyright 2001 Stephen Lewis.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the author.
The Ottoman Architectural Patrimony of Bulgaria

Stephen Lewis

From the fourteenth century to the late-nineteenth, the land comprising present-day Bulgaria was an integral part of the Ottoman Empire. Almost half a millennium of Ottoman rule left Bulgaria with a rich legacy of Muslim religious monuments and the infrastructure of Ottoman secular life: Mosques, fountains, baths, bridges, caravansaries, markets, clock towers, fortifications, and heterodox shrines. These include some of the earliest known examples of Ottoman style and seminal works of Mimar Sinan.

In Studies in the Ottoman Architecture of the Balkans, Machiel Kiel addressed the significance of the Ottoman architecture of Bulgaria:

The vicissitudes of the … past one hundred years caused the majority of Ottoman monuments (in Bulgaria) to disappear, but the number of them preserved is still considerable … among them are works of the greatest quality which shed ample light on some important phases in the development of this architecture. Our knowledge of Ottoman Turkish monuments in Bulgaria … is far from complete, partly due to the relatively late date Bulgarian science began to realize their value and partly to the difficulty of Western and Turkish scholars to travel the land extensively.

Today, more than a decade after these words were published, Bulgaria and the majority of its monuments are open to Western and Turkish visitors both.

Ever since Bulgaria's independence from Ottoman rule in the 1870s, its patrimony of Ottoman architectural monuments has been ravaged by neglect and destruction – a process fueled by attempts to eradicate, rather

*Stephen Lewis, USA/Netherlands

than deal with, the complex historical, cultural, demographic, and physical legacies of the Ottoman period.

The rise of Bulgarian nationalism in the early nineteenth century occurred at a time of crisis in Ottoman rule and of Russian ambitions of southward expansion into Ottoman lands. Bulgaria's aspirations for independence were accompanied by a self-conscious search for a purely Bulgarian and pan-Slavic national identity, and an idealization of pre-Ottoman Bulgarian kingdoms and society. These contributed to a popular demonizing of the Ottoman period and of the peoples, institutions, and monuments – secular and religious – associated with Ottoman rule.

To this day, many Bulgarians still refer to the Ottoman period as 'slavery' or 'the yoke' – distorted simplifications reinforced by folk legends of forced conversions and exaggerated magnitude of the devşirme, as well as by early works of modern Bulgarian literature such as Ivan Vasov's late-nineteenth-century epic 'Under the Yoke.'

Past generations of Bulgarian historians have described the entire Ottoman period as a national catastrophe and a black hole during which time Bulgarian culture was destroyed and the country was forcibly Turkified – an approach rejected by Machiel Kiel in his Art and Society of Bulgaria in the Turkish Period. Fortunately, over the last decade, such extreme characterizations of the Ottoman period are seen as exaggerated and ideologically-colored by small but growing numbers of Bulgarian scholars and non-scholars.

In Bulgaria, as elsewhere in the Balkans, hostility towards the past has translated at times into hostility towards present-day manifestations of the past including the Turkish language, Turkish and Muslim cultural traditions, and Ottoman and Islamic monuments. In the most recent wave of destruction, a portion of Bulgaria's Ottoman architectural patrimony was razed during anti-Turkish and anti-Muslim campaigns in the 1970s and 1980s.

Paradoxically, the same period also witnessed the preservation and restoration of monuments such as downtown Sofia's late-sixteenth-century Banya Bashi Mosque which, together with an early-twentieth-century Orthodox church and Sofia's neo-Moorish Sephardic synagogue, form a triumvirate of monuments said to be symbolic of the traditional tolerance of Bulgaria – a tolerance that in large part is a legacy of the laws and ethos of the Ottoman period.

Destruction of Ottoman and Muslim monuments in Bulgaria continued well into the post-Communist period. In 1990, arsonists set ablaze the late-eighteenth-century Çarşî Camii in Haskovo (since restored) and, more recently, damaged the historic but architecturally nondescript türbe of Bali Efendi at Kniazhevo near Sofia. Ironically, this simple stucco structure

---

was itself a replacement for the original Ottoman tomb of Bali Efendi demolished soon after Bulgaria's independence.

Another portion of the Ottoman architecture of Bulgaria vanished as a result of urban renewal projects that gutted the cores of Bulgarian cities and towns during the 1950s-1980s. Lost monuments include the large Ottoman hamam in the center of Haskovo, one of the oldest hamams in Bulgaria, and the early-seventeenth-century Kurşunlu Han in the center of Plovdiv, one of the largest of the hans that once marked the way from Edirne to Skopje, Niş, and Belgrade.

Almost a century before, numerous Ottoman monuments had been vacated and left to collapse in the aftermath of the exodus of large numbers of Muslims from Bulgaria to Turkey during the decades following the first uprisings against Ottoman rule in the Christian derbenci towns of central Bulgaria. Indeed, from the Russo-Turkish War to the First and Second Balkan Wars, large parts of Bulgaria saw the wholesale flight of their Muslim populations – ethnic-Bulgarian Muslims ('Pomaks') as well as ethnic-Turkish Muslims. In parallel, Bulgaria's larger cities and towns began to shift from being largely Muslim to almost exclusively Christian in population – a process that has continued to the present.

The fifteenth-century Fatih Mosque in Kyustendil and the sixteenth-century Mosque of Ahmed Bey in present-day Dupnitsa are examples of major and lesser monuments in southwestern Bulgaria that now stand derelict, deprived of constituents and purpose. Other abandoned or appropriated Ottoman monuments were given new uses. Sofia's now minaret-less, nine-domed Büyük Cami, for example, has served as Bulgaria's National Archeological Museum since the beginning of the twentieth century. The strikingly slender and graceful mosque of Ahmed Bey built in 1573 over the ruins of Roman baths in the present-day city of Kyustendil is also a museum.

Not all destruction of Ottoman monuments in Bulgaria has been intentional. It is important to remember that much of the physical infrastructure of Ottoman life had been tied to a pre-modern urban landscape and to patterns of life and routes of trade that entered into decline long before the end of Ottoman rule. The obsolescence of külliye-, çarşı-, and mahalle-based towns, and the rise of commercial, administrative, mixed-residential, and grid-based city centers during the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries swept away historical buildings in numerous Bulgarian towns.

In some cases, Bulgaria's Ottoman monuments have been explained away rather than physically destroyed. During the nineteenth century, many

---

4 With thanks to Prof. Raina Gavrilova of Sofia University for the loan of her unpublished manuscript on this subject.
traditional features of Ottoman towns became symbols of Bulgaria's national emergence and self-consciously western orientation. Nineteenth-century Ottoman clock towers were adopted as symbols of Bulgaria's modern aspirations. In cities and towns such as Plovdiv and Karlovo, that to this day preserve residential neighborhoods barely changed since Ottoman times, traditional Turkish houses and konaks are referred to as characteristic products of the 'Bulgarian National Renaissance.' Sun-burst pattern ceiling woodcarvings and decorated alafranga niches, typical features of Turkish houses, are said to be uniquely Bulgarian motifs.

Other, older Ottoman monuments sometimes are ascribed to pre-Ottoman cultures. In many parts of Bulgaria, Ottoman bridges or roads still are referred to as Roman or Byzantine. The remaining wall of a fifteenth-century Musala in the present-day Sofia suburb of Lozenetz – a site of military encampment during Ottoman campaigns against Belgrade, Hungary, and Vienna – was, until 1999, called the 'Roman Wall,' despite its very obvious mihrab. Following the recent refurbishing of the open-air market that surrounds it, the remaining wall of the Musala was officially renamed 'The Old Wall.'

Today, many of Bulgaria's remaining Ottoman monuments are in disrepair, their survival threatened by indifference, lack of funds, and the depredations of vandals. On the positive side, in 1999 the Bulgarian Ministry of Culture made a public statement of commitment to Islamic monuments, announcing that 10 percent of monuments preservation funds will go to towards their care – Muslims comprising at least ten percent of Bulgaria's population of roughly eight million. Unfortunately this is ten percent of a meager, inadequate total sum. Funds for the care of monuments are scarce in post-communist Bulgaria.

Despite the scope of destruction and decay, Bulgaria's remaining Ottoman architecture offers insights into the economic and social history of Bulgaria and into the genesis and evolution of Ottoman style.

Possibly the oldest of Ottoman monuments north of Edirne is the late-fourteenth-century Imaret Camii in the town of Ikhtiman (Figure 1), the next to last caravan stop on the road from Edirne to Sofia. This monument is one of the few T-shaped Ottoman structures to be found in the Balkans. The lovely irregular stone and brickwork of its exterior suggest that the structure may have been the work of local craftsmen schooled in late Byzantine traditions. Traces of remaining hearths and chimneys in its interior dividing walls suggest that the structure was originally built as a zaviye and only later functioned exclusively as a mosque. The present condition of the Imaret Camii is deplorable, in contrast to that of the former hamam of Ikhtiman, a structure originating from the fourteenth century with domes dating from the fifteenth and additions from later centuries. The exterior of the hamam has been restored and the building now serves as a coffee house and discotheque, a bright spot in an otherwise dreary provincial town.
Hints as to the possible original appearance of the Ikhtiman Zaviye can be found in the city of Plovdiv, the site of another much larger T-shaped mosque (Figure 2) dating to the 1430s. This mosque was restored by the Bulgarian architect Nikola Mushanov during the 1960s. Mushanov rebuilt the lateral tabhanes of the zaviya to their original height. Their openings to the central space of the mosque are from a later period, the central area originally having served as an inner court leading to the raised sanctuary. The ensemble had been converted into a single structure sometime during the seventeenth century. Plovdiv is also home to an immense nine-domed Friday Mosque (Figure 3) dating to the early-fifteenth centuries. Both the Imaret and Friday mosques are currently in use.

Nineteenth-century photographs show the skyline of Plovdiv filled with minarets. Today, only one other mosque remains in Plovdiv in addition to the two mentioned above: the late-sixteenth-century Orta Mezar Camii, in recent years transformed into a restaurant. Plovdiv also boasts a large Ottoman hamam, popularly called the çifte hamam (a twin structure as its name suggests) which Machiel Kiel dates to the late fifteenth century. A recent cleaning of the interior of the Plovdiv hamam revealed a number of drawings of mosques and ships incised in the original layer of plaster coating its interior walls. The hamam, gutted by fire three decades ago, is now used occasionally as an art gallery.

Single-domed mosques can still be found throughout Bulgaria. The earliest single-domed Ottoman structures include the early fifteenth-century Mosque of Hamza Bey in Stara Zagora (deprived of its minaret during the 1980s and today functioning as a gallery of the Stara Zagora municipal museum) and the Fatih Camii built in Kyustendil during the reign of Mehmed II. Today, the Fatih Camii is on the brink of collapse. A graceful seventeenth-century mosque in present-day Suvorovo near Varna is one of the few relatively early Ottoman single-domed mosques still in use in Bulgaria.

Later periods of Ottoman architecture are represented by the eighteenth-century Lale-period Şerif Halil Paşa complex in Shumen (Figure 4), the only surviving complete külliye in all of Bulgaria, and one of the largest mosques ever built north of Edirne. Surviving nineteenth-century works include the reconstruction of the fifteenth-century Bayraklı mosque in the former mining and commercial town of Samokov. The Bayraklı Cami was rebuilt as a pitched-roofed structure with a wooden interior dome. The dome and interior walls were lavishly decorated by nineteenth-century Bulgarian craftsmen. Today, the Samokov mosque is a museum.

Wooden-columned mosques are widespread throughout the predominantly ethnic-Turkish and ethnic-Bulgarian Muslim central region of the Rhodope Mountains. The nineteenth-century Çarşı Camii at Ardino, with richly painted columns, and ceiling panels decorated in carpet motifs, provides a colorful example (Figure 5).
Traces of older, more primitive traditions of wooden construction survive across a broad swath of Eastern Bulgaria. From the Rhodope Mountains almost to the banks of the Danube, centuries-old basilica-shaped wooden mosques reflect Anatolian traditions unseen elsewhere in the Bulgaria. Local legends hold that the wooden mosque in the present-day village of Podkova (Figure 6), in the eastern Rhodope Mountains of southern Bulgaria, dates from the fifteenth century. According to these legends, seven virgins descended from the sky and built the mosque in a single night from wooden beams and pegs, and without using a single metal nail. Far to the north, the two to three hundred year old wooden mosque in the present-day village of Raden Voivoda (Figure 7), at the edge of the Deli Orman region in northeast Bulgaria, is abandoned and on the verge of collapse.

Bulgaria also contains some of the most magnificent Ottoman bridges in the Balkans. These include: the late-fifteenth-century bridge of İnegöllü Ishak Paşa (Figure 8) over the River Struma at Nevestino, on the main road from Istanbul to Skopje; the late-sixteenth-century bridge of Siyavuş Paşa at the town of Harmanlı; and the bridge over the River Maritsa (Figure 9) at Cisr-i Mustafa Paşa (modern-day Svilengrad on the Bulgarian-Turkish border) dated 1528, the earliest surviving work of Mimar Sinan.

An immense domed and porticoed sixteenth-century mosque in the village of Uzundjovo (Figure 10) in Bulgarian Thrace reveals routes of trade and aspects of the commercial importance of rural Bulgaria during Ottoman times. The mosque at Uzundjovo, which was converted to a church in the late nineteenth or early twentieth century, is, in terms of size and splendor, totally out of proportion to the tiny agricultural village in which it is set. The open square – now a tethering and grazing place for horses and mules – in front of the former mosque indicates the immensity of the vanished külliye of which the mosque had formed the major part. The size of the külliye, in turn, suggests that Uzundjovo had been founded with the intent to develop into a larger, thriving center. Although it remained small, Uzundjovo – strategically located at the junction of trade routes from Edirne

---

3 With thanks to Prof. Nicola Mushanov, Sofia, Bulgaria, who, in the midst of serious illness, patiently described to me the locations of wooden mosques he surveyed during the 1960s and 1970s.
4 Popularly called the Kadın Most (Woman's Bridge) in mixed Turkish and Bulgarian. Local legend has it that the architect sacrificed his wife to ensure completion of the bridge's main arch.
5 Built to span the Ulu Dere river, this magnificent bridge now spans a shallow concrete flood control channel that is dry most of the year.
west to Skopje and Belgrade and north to Poland and the Slavic East – did become the site of one of the major fairs of the late-Ottoman Balkans.8

The phenomenon of a large Ottoman mosque later converted to a church can also be seen in Sofia. The exterior of the mid-sixteenth-century Sofu Mehmed Paşa Camii (Figure 11), a mosque originally based on a design by Sinan, was radically modified following its conversion to an Orthodox Church (The Church of the Seven Disciples) at the turn of the twentieth century. The park surrounding the church marks the precinct of the former külliye. Only the church's domed interior preserves the original architectural concept.

Amongst the most dramatic of the Ottoman monuments of rural Bulgaria are isolated Türbes containing the historic or cenotaphic tombs of saints venerated by the heterodox orders. These Türbes had once been the cores of tekkes, most of which, in Bulgaria, eventually fell under the influence of the Bektashi order. Bulgaria's tekkes were destroyed all or in part soon after the repression of the Janissaries and the dervish orders in 1826. Most Türbes, however, were left intact. In the vicinities of several, traces of other structures comprising the former tekke complexes can be still be found.

At least five of the remaining Türbes in Bulgaria stand out as gems of Ottoman art. Of these, four are interrelated in architecture, history, and legends concerning their founding.

The Türbe of Kızıdemli Baba, situated on an isolated hillside near Nova Zagora, is intact despite having been ransacked during the 1960s by illicit treasure hunters who smashed open the grave of the saint.9 The Türbe of Ak Yazılı Baba (Figure 12) near Balchik on the Bulgarian Black Sea Coast was appropriated as a Christian shrine late in the nineteenth century.10 The walls that still surround this monument mark the boundaries of the former tekke compound, which also contains the remains of a seven-sided meydán. The eighteenth-century Türbe of Demir Baba in northeast Bulgaria is still a vital place of pilgrimage. The Türbe of Otman or Ataman Baba (Osman Baba in the speech of locals) in the foothills of the Rhodope Mountains near Haskovo in Bulgarian Thrace remains, to this day, a functioning shrine.

9 Although isolated and not the site of major pilgrimages, the Türbe apparently still attracts lone worshippers. On a visit in 1998, I observed candle stubs and other evidence of respectful visitors.
10 During a visit to the site in 1997, I observed both Bektashi and Christian symbols hung on the wall of the Türbe and placed around the grave of the saint. In the summer of 2000, the grave of the saint was adorned with postcard-sized reproductions of Christian icons, and with bolts of cloth, dolls, and cigarettes that, according to the guard of the Türbe, had been left by a recent busload of Turkish visitors.
The octagonal shape of the well-preserved türbe at Bogomil (Figure 13) in the hills of Thrace between the present-day towns of Harmanlı and Elkovo makes it atypical of most other surviving türbes in Bulgaria, the majority of which are seven-sided. Nonetheless, the türbe at Bogomil is as strikingly beautiful as the other four in terms of form, execution, and setting.

The revival of religious life in post-Communist Bulgaria brought mixed results for the country's Ottoman architectural patrimony. On the one hand, new life has been breathed into many surviving places of worship, Muslim as well as Christian and Jewish. In addition, at a number of locations, new mosques are being built, but in imported styles having no continuity with past traditions, Ottoman or post-Ottoman. Renewed flows of Alevi and Gypsy (Roma) pilgrims have revivified and brought needed donations to a number of heterodox shrines – but sometimes at the price of overwhelming local traditions and practices. The türbe of Otman Baba provides a case in point.

The türbe of Otman Baba stands at the edge of a village populated by both Alevis and Sunni Muslims. Quite unsurprisingly, the village is named Teketo, Bulgarized Turkish for 'The tekke.' The türbe of Osman Baba (Figure 14) is a magnificent example of early-sixteenth-century Ottoman architecture. Its form – a graceful domed structure – places it firmly in Ottoman funerary style. The ashlar stone work of the türbe is immaculate in its precision, suggesting that the structure was constructed by workmen brought from centers of Ottoman building and craftsmanship such as Istanbul, Edirne, or Bursa. Most early Ottoman monuments built in Bulgaria by local craftsmen tended to incorporate rough and robust provincial versions of Byzantine techniques of stone and brickwork – as can be seen in the nearby early-Ottoman Turbe of Ali Baba (Figure 15).

A second look reveals that the architecture of the türbe of Otman Baba, like most surviving türbes in Bulgaria, is a physical embodiment of Shiite symbolism. The türbe of Otman Baba is seven-sided rather than octagonal in shape as a casual observer might expect from a domed structure in the Ottoman tradition. According to Prof. de Jong\textsuperscript{11} this seven-sided shape may be read as a symbolic reference to the Yediler, the seven central figures of Shiism: Mohammed, Ali, Fatima, Hasan, Husain, the angel Gabriel, and Salman Pak, the helper of Ali in this world and the next.

The physical setting of the türbe of Otman Baba places it squarely in the context of the religious history of the Balkans and the processes of continuity, appropriation and change described in detail by the British observer Hasluck\textsuperscript{12} early in the twentieth century. Hasluck emphasized the traditional sacred nature of the surroundings in which monuments such as the türbe and former tekke of Otman Baba were sited. It is likely that the site

\textsuperscript{11} F. de Jong, 'The Iconography of Bektashism,' in Manuscripts of the Middle East, No. 4 (1989).
\textsuperscript{12} F. W. Hasluck, Christianity and Islam under the Sultans, New York 1973.
of the türbe of Otman Baba has been held sacred and visited for its ostensible healing powers at least since Thracian times. Typical attributes of such sites include sacred trees, sacred rocks, sacred sources of healing water,13 and burial places visited for sacrifice, prayer, beseechment, and thanksgiving. The hill on the side of which the türbe of Otman Baba is sited contains all these attributes. Also, like many other Bektashi sites, the türbe and former tekke offer an impressive view of the surrounding plains and command a strategic position well suited for defense.

Residents of Teketo describe the natural and manmade features of the hill above the former tekke in terms of local legend. They explain to visitors that sinkholes in the exposed bedrock at the top of the hill are the footsteps of Otman Baba and that three seemingly pre-Christian, pre-Muslim altar-like structures carved from the bedrock are basins in which Otman Baba had washed his shirts. Continuity between sites of Bulgarian tekkes and Thracian holy places is also obvious at the türbe of Demir Baba. This former tekke is set at the foot of a valley at Sveshtari in the Dobrich region that also contains an extensive Thracian tomb complex. The türbe of Demir Baba itself is built on top of the remains of a hewn stone platform possibly of pagan origin.

Gypsies – Roma – are one of the major ethnic groups of Bulgaria. Ottoman records indicate the permanent presence of large numbers of Roma at the tekke of Otman Baba as early as 1568.14 In recent years, in part due to increased ownership of automobiles, the number of Roma pilgrims to the türbe of Otman Baba has increased dramatically.

Donations and attentions lavished on the türbe of Otman Baba by Roma pilgrims resulted in a number of changes to the shrine and have initiated a process of expropriation not unlike that described by Hasluck. By 1997, the heavy wooden doors of the türbe and the thick iron bars on its windows had been painted vibrant pink by Roma donors. Inside the shrine, the seventeenth-century headstone on the grave of Otman Baba had been painted in silvery aluminum radiator paint. One of the former windows of the shrine, permanently bricked shut decades before, was filled with dolls, postcards, and astrological guides left by Roma visitors. Amidst prints of Ali and Haci Bektaş, the two walls behind the headstone of the grave were hung with Christmas lights and framed photographs of the Roma donors.

The türbe of Otman Baba is a living monument and thus, in a sense, is symbolic of the vicissitudes of Ottoman Architecture in Balkan lands. New roles and a constant flow of visitors ensure its physical survival but also increase the chance of modification beyond recognition. Paradoxically, the absence of such a living context would possibly lead to dereliction and collapse.

13 A spring flowing from an outcrop at the pinnacle of the hill above the türbe is visited by pilgrims seeking cures for eye afflictions.

14 As communicated orally by Prof. M. Kiel.
According to a Bektashi tale recounted by 1930s observer John Birge, at the age of four the future Hacı Bektaş Veli became a pupil of an apostle of a great saint. One day, this teacher saw two men instructing his new pupil in the Koran. When asked who the men were, young Bektaş replied that one was "... my ancestor Mohammed Mustafa, may peace be upon him, and the other ... the lion of the lord, the lord of the worlds and commander of the faithful Ali el-Mürteza."\(^{15}\)

Legends change to fit new circumstances. Some years ago, at the türbe of Ötman Baba, a Bektashi elder explained to this writer that many of the holy figures of Christianity and Islam were indeed one and the same. He said that wherever Hacı Bektaş went two angels accompanied him, one hovering above his left shoulder and the other above his right. These, he said, were the spirits of Islam and Christianity.

The architectural patrimony of Bulgaria includes both Christian and Muslim traditions. Hopefully, both will be protected and survive.

---

Figure 1: İmaret Camii, Ikhtiman
Figure 2: İmaret Camii, Plovdiv
Figure 3: Friday Mosque, Plovdiv
Figure 4: Şerif Halil Paşa Camii, Shumen
Figure 5: Çarşı Camii, Ardino
Figure 6: Wooden Mosque, Podkova
Figure 7: Wooden Mosque, Raden Voivoda
Figure 8: Bridge of İnegöllü Ishak Paşa, Struma River, Nevestino
Figure 9: Bridge of Mustafa Paşa, Svilengrad
Figure 10: Mosque converted to church, Uzundjovo
Figure 11: Church of the Seven Disciples, the former Mosque of Sufi Mehmed Paşa Camii, Sofia
Figure 12: Türbe of Ak Yazılı Baba
Figure 13: Türbe, village of Bogomil
Figure 14: Türbe of Otman Baba
Figure 15: Türbe of Ali Baba